

**Congress of the United States**  
**Washington, DC 20515**

November 4, 2015

The Honorable Gina McCarthy  
Administrator  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460

Dear Administrator McCarthy,

We write to express significant concern with the recently proposed 2016 Renewable Volume Obligations (RVO) under the Renewable Fuel Standard (RFS). The RVO as currently proposed would constitute a breach of the ethanol blendwall, which would cause adverse impacts on American consumers and the economy.

Congress expanded the RFS when it passed the Energy Independence and Security Act of 2007 (EISA). EISA mandated an annually increasing volume of biofuel to be blended and consumed in the nation's motor fuel supply, reaching 36 billion gallons of biofuels in 2022. In 2007, the market assumptions regarding the future of transportation fuels in the United States were very different from the realities of the market today. The Energy Information Administration (EIA) at the time projected motor gasoline demand to significantly rise through 2022<sup>1</sup>. Since then, EIA has revised its 2007 projection of motor gasoline in 2022 downward by 27% and projects motor gasoline demand to continue to decline through 2035<sup>1</sup>.

Increased fuel efficiency has led to shrinking gasoline demand. This current reality, coupled with an increasing biofuel blending level requirement, has exacerbated the onset of the E10 blendwall—the point at which the gasoline supply is saturated with the maximum amount of ethanol that the current vehicle fleet, marine and other small engines, and refueling infrastructure can safely accommodate. We agree with the EPA's conclusion in its first RVO proposal for 2014 and in its current proposal for 2014, 2015, and 2016 that the E10 blendwall is a binding constraint.

We are gravely concerned, however, that despite the Agency's recognition of the blendwall, the 2016 proposal acknowledges that it will be breached nonetheless. Specifically, EPA states that the 2016 RVO "includes volumes of renewable fuel that will require either ethanol use at levels significantly beyond the level of the E10 blendwall, or significantly greater use of non-ethanol renewable fuels than has occurred to date."<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Energy Information Administration, *Annual Energy Outlook 2007-2015*, Reference Case Table 11

<sup>2</sup> Federal Register, Vol. 80, No. 111, Wednesday, June 10, 2015, Proposed Rules (p.33102), *EPA Renewable Fuel Standard Program: Standards for 2014, 2015, and 2016 and Biomass-Based Diesel Volume for 2017; Proposed Rule*

Multiple studies have shown detrimental economic harm may be caused by breaching the E10 blendwall. A 2014 report on the RFS by the nonpartisan Congressional Budget Office concluded that requiring the volumes of biofuel in EISA, which would breach the blendwall, could increase the price of E10 gasoline by up to 26 cents per gallon<sup>3</sup>. NERA concludes in a July 27, 2015 study that "higher gasoline prices leave consumers with less disposable income<sup>4</sup>", further hindering economic growth. An RFS study by Charles River Associates concurs: "The result [of exceeding the blendwall] will be limited availability, higher consumer costs, and fewer sales of conventional transportation fuels<sup>5</sup>." This adverse economic harm falls hardest on America's lower income families.

EPA acknowledges that its 2016 RVO proposal would require significant greater use of E15 and E85 in order to meet the proposed mandate in 2016. Therefore, this proposal is problematic not only in principle, but it is also impractical since it would take decades, not months, to build out the compatible vehicle fleet and install the necessary retail infrastructure to accommodate the higher blends of ethanol. AAA calculates that only 5% of the vehicles on the road are approved to use E15<sup>6</sup> and the EIA calculates that only 6% of vehicles can use E85<sup>7</sup>. The refueling retail infrastructure is even more limited with only 2% of retail stations selling E85<sup>8</sup> and only 100 stations nationwide selling E15<sup>9</sup>.

Congress will continue its work toward a bipartisan solution to deal with the RFS. As this work continues, it is critical that EPA use its statutory authority to waive EISA's conventional biofuel volume to keep the blending requirements below the E10 blendwall, and to help limit the economic and consumer harm this program has already caused.

Sincerely,



Bill Flores  
Member of Congress



Peter Welch  
Member of Congress



Bob Goodlatte  
Member of Congress



Jim Costa  
Member of Congress



Steve Womack  
Member of Congress

<sup>3</sup> Congressional Budget Office, *The Renewable Fuel Standard: Issues for 2014 and Beyond* (June 2014)

<sup>4</sup> NERA Economic Consulting, *Economic Impacts Resulting from Implementation of RFS2 Program* (July 2015)

<sup>5</sup> Charles River Associates, *Impact of the Blend Wall Constraint in Complying with the Renewable Fuel Standard* (November 2011)

<sup>6</sup> American Automobile Association, Press Release "New E15 Gasoline May Damage Vehicles and Cause Consumer Confusion" (December 2012)

<sup>7</sup> Energy Information Administration, *Annual Energy Outlook 2014*

<sup>8</sup> Fuels Institute, *E85: A Market Performance Analysis and Forecast* (2014)

<sup>9</sup> Renewable Fuels Association data ([www.ethanolrfa.org](http://www.ethanolrfa.org))



Jeff P...

Zou Barletta

Bob...

Glenn Thompson

Steve...

Howard...

Jim Heck

Larry...

Jim Bidenstein

For Z...

Bill Posey

Rob...

Tim

Bruce Western

Minel M'Carl

Art...

Jacobin Castro

Don B. Love

Robert J. Dald

Robert P. Panger

D. G. C. C.

Robert A. Bernick

Minerva C. C.

Kim B. B.

Thomas Massie

Will Hurd

Joseph M. K.

Tom Lice

Barbara Comstock

Charles J. Throckm

St. J. J.

Gregg Harper

Gregg Harper

Diana Lavin

John P. P.

Mr. D.

Ryan Costello

Denny Heck

D-d Rouzer

Joseph R Pitts

Scott Rigell

M Viny

Michael

David B. McTee

David J. Schmitt

Ocie R. Rouse

Pete King

Jill Miller

Mark V. Anderson

Dan Boat

Fred Minner

John Ratcliffe

Ch. Stewart

Shirley Rogers



Don Brink

Rita W. Allen GA-12

Ted S. Galt

Barry K. Weber

Joe Holz

Pat M. Ayth

Paul A. Landon MS

Eric H. Jenkins

Glenn Grothman

Joe J. J.

Fab Velk

Mya Pompeo

John O'Meara

Earl L. Buddy Carter

Nichol Hudson

Mike Bishop

Roller

1 Dean Nunn

Lair Funkel

Blake Funtkelet

Kay Hansen

~~John H. H. H.~~

Jaime Herrera Beutler

W. M. H. H. VA-9

Mark McSally

Quinn Black

N. H. H.

Markwayne Mullin

Renee E. H.

Alex X. Mooney

Mo Brooks

D. Amodeo (Hill AR-2)

Paul Cook

Clint Collins (NY-27)

Keith J. Rothfus

K. J. H.

CPA

Sally Lang  
Hassard

J. Jadar

Judy Alice

Andy Barn

Greg Campbell

Paul Shih TX-19

Robert Williams

Dan Ambrose

Raul R. Labrador

Mike Kelly

Zu Zhi NY-01

Doug Collins GA-9

CW Boushara D

DL

Trey Gandy

Fred R. Wenzel



Andreas

Rob Woodall

R. L. Taylor

Joe Barton

John Barte

Sen. M. Bilirakis

Pete Olson

Mark Sanford

John G. ...

Pete DeFazio

Andre Custer

John ...

Doug Walen

D. ...

Chell R

[Signature]

Lynn ...

Mac ...

Hj Cuellar  
Charles W Dent

Paul Hef  
Dan Rosten

John Hensarling

Sam Johnson

Joe Wilson

Ed Royce

Scott Garrett

Mike Spivey

Jeff Sessions

Ken Meek

Eric Lipton

Rubin Hinojosa

Marsha Blackburn

Griffith  
PPH Jones

Bill Sum

Ken Young

Steve Scalise

Walter B. Jones

Virginia Foxx

St. Shaht

Paul Smith

Lamar Smith

Austin Scott

Frank A. Lobato

J. M. Chis

John R. Gandy

Jeff Flinn

Leonard Lance

John Culberson

Doug Lamborn

AMM

Mike Gahm

Tim Murphy



Ann Hunt

Kurt Schuler

Steve Poon

Synthia P. Lummis

Kent Starks

Jim Walling

Tom Reed NY 23

Tom Graves

Mike Colton

Ben R. Lujan

James H. Murray WI-05

Erin O'Brien

Steve L. Fink

Dr. Green

Robert J. Wittman

K. J. H. H. H.

Bruce Soliquin

Kevin McCarthy

The Honorable Gina McCarthy  
Page 13

Page 3	
Jeff Duncan	Ryan Zinke
Lou Barletta	Bill Posey
Bradley Byrne	Rob Bishop
Glenn Thompson	Robert Hurt
Steve Russell	Bruce Westerman
Tom Price	Michael T. McCaul
Joe Heck	Garret Graves
Gary Palmer	Joaquin Castro
Jim Bridenstine	Mia B. Love

Page 4	
Robert J. Dold	Tom Rice
Robert Pittenger	Barbara Comstock
Dennis A. Ross	Charles J. "Chuck" Fleischmann
Robert Aderholt	Cedric Richmond
Mimi Walters	Barry Loudermilk
Kevin Brady	Gregg Harper
Thomas Massie	Brian Babin
Will Hurd	Richard Hanna
Doug LaMalfa	Ron DeSantis

Page 5	
Ryan Costello	David P. Roe
Denny Heck	Peter King
David Rouzer	Jeff Miller
Joseph R. Pitts	Mark E. Amodei
Scott Rigell	Dave Brat
Marc A. Veasey	Frank Guinta
Scott DesJarlais	John Ratcliffe
David B. McKinley	Chris Stewart
David Schweikert	Steven M. Palazzo

Page 6	
Dan Benishek	Mario Diaz-Balart
Rick Allen	Filemon Vela
Ted Yoho	Mike Pompeo
Randy K. Weber, Sr.	Patrick Meehan
George Holding	Earl L. "Buddy" Carter
Tom MacArthur	Richard Hudson
Paul Gosar	Mike Bishop
Evan Jenkins	David Valadao
Glenn Grothman	Devin Nunes

Page 7	
Lois Frankel	Blake Farenthold
Kay Granger	Steve Knight
Jamie Herrera Beutler	H. Morgan Griffith
Martha McSally	Diane Black
John Katko	Markwayne Mullin
Renee Ellmers	Alexander X. Mooney
Mo Brooks	French Hill
Paul Cook	Chris Collins
Keith Rothfus	Scott Perry

Page 8	
Christopher P. Gibson	Dan Newhouse
Billy Long	Raul R. Labrador
Andy Harris	Mike Kelly
Jim Jordan	Lee Zeldin
Jody Hice	Doug Collins
Andy Barr	Charles W. Boustany, Jr.
Carlos Curbelo	Trent Kelly
Randy K. Neugebauer	Trey Gowdy
Roger Williams	Bradley Wenstrup

Page 9	
Eric A. "Rick" Crawford	Peter DeFazio
Rob Woodall	Ander Crenshaw
Richard Nugent	John Fleming
Joe Barton	Gregg Walden
John Carter	David W. Jolly
Gus M. Bilirakis	Chellie Pingree
Pete Olson	John Mica
Mark Sanford	Lynn Westmoreland
John J. Duncan, Jr.	Mac Thornberry

Page 10	
Henry Cuellar	Darrell E. Issa
Charles W. Dent	Dana Rohrabacher
Jeb Hensarling	Sam Johnson
Joe Wilson	Edward R. Royce
Scott Garrett	Michael K. Simpson
Pete Sessions	Kenny Marchant
Louie Gohmert	Ruben Hinojosa
Marsha Blackburn	G. K. Butterfield
Bill Shuster	Rodney P. Frelinghuysen

Page 11	
Don Young	Tom McClintock
Steve Scalise	Michael C. Burgess
Walter B. Jones	Matt Salmon
Virginia Foxx	Leonard Lance
Steve Chabot	John Abney Culberson
Christopher H. Smith	Doug Lamborn
Lamar Smith	Ted Poe
Austin Scott	Mick Mulvaney
Frank A. LoBiondo	Tim Murphy

Page 12	
Duncan Hunter	Kurt Schrader
Stevan Pearce	Cynthia Lummis
Trent Franks	Tim Walberg
Tom Reed	Tom Graves
Mike Coffman	Ben Ray Lujan
F. James Sensenbrenner	Tom Cole
Stephen Fincher	Gene Green
Robert J. Wittman	K. Michael Conaway
Bruce Poliquin	Kevin McCarthy